

University of Miami Law Review

VOLUME 65

SPRING 2011

NUMBER 3

EXECUTIVE BOARD

STEPHANIE HAUSER

Editor-in-Chief

DAVID D. GRUBERG
Executive Editor

GAYLAND O. HETHCOAT
Executive Editor

DAVID AXELMAN
*Senior Articles
Editor*

GISELLE JIMENEZ
*Managing
Editor*

ERIN BOHANNON
*Senior Notes & Comments
Editor*

COLLEEN DEL CASINO
Writing & Research Editor

DALE S. DOBULER
Projects Editor

MELANIE FERNANDEZ
Eleventh Circuit Editor

COSME CABALLERO
Articles & Comments Editor

ASRA CHATHAM
Articles & Comments Editor

SHANNA FORD
Articles & Comments Editor

ERIC SCHMELZER
Articles & Comments Editor

DANIEL M. SCHWARZ
Articles & Comments Editor

ALEXANDER SMITH
Articles & Comments Editor

EVA MERIAN SPAHN
Articles & Comments Editor

DOUGLAS STAMM
Articles & Comments Editor

EDITORIAL BOARD

PAOLA ABELLO
NICK AGNELLO
DANIEL BACHMAN
STEPHEN BACON
ARTHUR BAKER
LAUREN BARNES
ELISABETH BEAL
DAVID BEHAR
RYAN BOLLMAN
GREGORY BOULOS
THERESA N. BRESLIN
LIVIA CHAYKIN
JONATHAN COHN
KAYLEE COX
PETER J. CUNHA
WILLIAM A. DANIEL
TESS DELIEFDE
KATHRYN DEMARCO
ZACHARY DICKENS
MICHAEL FASANO
TODD FRIEDMAN

VANESSA FRISBY
NICHOLE GEIGER
MALLORY GOLD
JENNIFER HAMMITT
MICHAEL A. HOLT
EMILY HOROWITZ
AIMEE JOBLOVE
JARED KESSLER
QUINSHAWNA LANDON
MICHAEL LARSON
JARRED LEIBNER
KAYLA LELAND
KORISSA LEPORE
TAL J. LIFSHITZ
BRIAN LOSS
BRENDAN MACKESEY
DECLAN MAHONEY
NYANA MILLER
DAVID MUCKLEY
DALE NOLL
TOM OGLESBY
DAIJA PAGE

KELLY RAINS
LAWRENCE REGER
MICHAEL REGINA
WENDI L. RIBAUDO
ELIZABETH RIESER-MURPHY
BESHROY RIZK
ANA ROMES
JENNIFER ROSSEL
LAURAN SAN ROMAN
TAMAR SENIKIDZE
RONNIE SOLOMON
MICHAEL STEINBERGER
JONATHAN STITT
OLGA TARASENKO
MARISOL VILASUSO
JUSTIN WALES
AARON WILLIAMS
VICTORIA WILSON
SEIDA A. WOOD
JESSICA ZIETZ
FRANCESCO ZINCONE

FARAH BARQUERO
Administrative Assistant

UNIVERSITY OF MIAMI SCHOOL OF LAW

ADMINISTRATION

Donna E. Shalala, B.A., Ph.D., *President of the University*
Thomas J. LeBlanc, B.S., M.S., Ph.D., *Provost, & Executive Vice President*
Patricia D. White, B.A., M.A., J.D., *Dean, & Professor of Law*
Patrick O. Gudridge, A.B., J.D., *Vice Dean, & Professor of Law*
Raquel M. Matas, B.A., J.D., *Associate Dean for Administration*
Georgina Angones, B.A., *Assistant Dean for Law Development and Alumni Relations*
Douglas K. Bischoff, A.B., J.D., LL.M., *Associate Dean & Director of the Graduate Program in Real Property Development*
Marcelyn Cox, B.A., J.D., *Assistant Dean, Career Development Office*
Michael L. Goodnight, B.A., M.S., *Assistant Dean of Admissions and Enrollment Management*
Jeannette F. Hausler, A.B., J.D., *Dean of Students Emerita*
Marni B. Lennon, B.A., Ms.Ed., J.D., *Assistant Dean for Public Interest and Pro Bono, Director, HOPE Public Interest Resource Center & Adjunct Professor of Law*
Ileana Porras, B.A., M.Phil., J.D., *Associate Dean of Academia Affairs*
Janet E. Stearns, B.A., J.D., *Dean of Students*
William P. VanderWyden, III, B.A., M.Ed., J.D., *Associate Dean of Students*

FACULTY

David Abraham, B.A., M.A., Ph.D., J.D., *Professor of Law, & University of Miami Law Review Faculty Advisor*
Jamila K. Alexander, B.S., M.A., J.D., *Lecturer in Law*
Anthony V. Alfieri, A.B., J.D., *Professor of Law, & Director of the Center for Ethics & Public Service*
Terence J. Anderson, B.A., J.D., *Professor of Law*
Paula Arias, J.D., *Lecturer in Law, & Director of International Moot Court Program*
Jill Barton, B.J., B.A., M.S., J.D., *Lecturer in Law*
Ricardo Bascuas, B.A., J.D., *Associate Professor of Law*
Michele DeStefano Beardslee, B.A., J.D., *Associate Professor of Law*
Susan E. Bennett, B.S., B.A., M.A., J.D., *Lecturer in Law*
Danton Asher Berube, Ph.D., J.D., *Lecturer in Law*
Caroline Bettinger-Lopez, B.A., J.D., *Associate Professor of Clinical Legal Education, & Director, Human Rights Clinic*
William Blatt, A.B., J.D., *Professor of Law*
Caroline M. Bradley, LL.M., *Professor of Law*
Patricia A. Brown, B.S.F.S., J.D., *Director, Graduate Program in Taxation*
Sergio Campos, A.B., J.D., *Associate Professor of Law*
Kenneth M. Casebeer, A.B., J.D., *Professor of Law*
Donna K. Coker, B.S.W., M.S.W., J.D., *Professor of Law*
Mary I. Coombs, B.A., M.A., J.D., *Professor of Law*
Charlton Copeland, B.A., M.A.R., J.D., *Associate Professor of Law*
Caroline Mala Corbin, M.A., J.D., *Associate Professor of Law*
Stephen M. Diamond, B.A., A.M., Ph.D., J.D., *Professor of Law*
Mary Doyle, B.A., LL.B., *Dean Emerita, & Professor of Law*
Alyssa Dragnich, B.A., J.D., *Lecturer in Law*
Cynthia A. Drew, B.A., M.A., Ph.D., J.D., *Associate Professor of Law*
Marc Fajer, A.B., J.D., *Professor of Law*
Zanita E. Fenton, A.B., J.D., *Professor of Law*
Mary Anne Franks, B.A., M.Phil., Ph.D., J.D., *Associate Professor of Law*
Christina M. Frohock, B.A., M.A., J.D., *Lecturer in Law*
A. Michael Froomkin, M.Phil., J.D., *Professor of Law*
Michael H. Graham, B.S.E., J.D., *Professor of Law, & Director of Summer Abroad Programs*
Susan Haack, B.A., M.A., B.Phil., Ph.D., *Distinguished Professor in the Humanities, Cooper Senior Scholar in Arts and Sciences, Professor of Philosophy, & Professor of Law*
Stephen K. Halpert, A.B., J.D., *Professor of Law*
Frances R. Hill, B.A., M.A., Ph.D., J.D., LL.M., *Professor of Law*
Elizabeth M. Iglesias, B.A., J.D., *Professor of Law*
Jan L. Jacobowitz, B.S., J.D., *Lecturer in Law, Associate Director of the Center for Ethics & Public Service, & Director of the Professional Responsibility and Ethics Program*
Osamudia James, B.A., J.D., LL.M., *Associate Professor of Law*
D. Marvin Jones, B.S., J.D., *Professor of Law*
Stanley I. Langbein, A.B., J.D., *Professor of Law*
Tamara Rice Lave, B.A., M.A., Ph.D., J.D., *Associate Professor of Law*
Kurt W. Lenz, B.A., J.D., *Lecturer in Law*

Lili Levi, A.B., J.D., *Professor of Law*
Lawrence Lokken, B.A., J.D., *Professor of Law*
Dennis O. Lynch, B.A., J.D., J.S.D., LL.M., *Dean Emeritus, & Professor of Law*
Martha R. Mahoney, B.A., M.A., J.D., *Professor of Law*
Elliott Manning, A.B., J.D., *Professor of Law*
Jessica Carvalho Morris, J.D., *Director of International Graduate Law Programs*
Sarah A. Mourer, B.S., J.D., *Assistant Professor of Clinical Legal Education*
George Mundstock, B.A., J.D., *Professor of Law*
Peter Nemerovski, B.A., J.D., *Lecturer in Law*
JoNel Newman, B.A., J.D., *Assistant Professor of Clinical Legal Education*
James W. Nickel, B.A., Ph.D., *Professor of Philosophy and Law*
Lara O'Neill, B.A., J.D., *Lecturer in Law and Director of International Public Interest Programs*
Bernard H. Oxman, A.B., J.D., *Professor of Law*
Kunal Parker, A.B., M.A., J.D., Ph.D., *Professor of Law*
Jan Paulson, A.B., J.D., *Michael Klein Distinguished Scholar Chair & Professor of Law*
Bernard P. Perlmutter, B.A., J.D., *Assistant Professor of Clinical Legal Education, & Director of the Children & Youth Law Clinic*
Shara Pelz, B.A., J.D., *Lecturer in Law*
Thomas A. Robinson, B.S., J.D., B.Litt., *Professor of Law*
Laurence M. Rose, B.A., J.D., *Professor of Law Emeritus, & Director of the Litigation Skills Program*
Robert E. Rosen, A.B., M.A., J.D., Ph.D., *Professor of Law*
Keith S. Rosenn, B.A., LL.B., *Professor of Law, & Chair of Foreign Graduate Law Program*
Edgardo Rotman, J.D., LL.M., Ph.D., LL.B., *Foreign & International Law Librarian, & Senior Lecturer in International & Comparative Law*
Rosario Schrier, B.A., J.D., *Associate Professor of Clinical Legal Education, & Director of Legal Communication and Research Skills*
Stephen J. Schnably, A.B., J.D., *Professor of Law*
Rebecca Sharpless, B.A., M.Phil., J.D., *Assistant Professor of Clinical Legal Education*
Rachel Smith, B.A., J.D., *Lecturer in Law*
Rachel Stabler, B.A., J.D., *Lecturer in Law*
Kele Stewart, J.D., *Associate Professor of Clinical Legal Education*
Irwin P. Stotzky, A.B., J.D., *Professor of Law*
Karen Throckmorton, B.A., J.D., LL.M., *Deputy Director of the Center for Ethics & Public Service*
Annette Torres, B.A., M.B.A., J.D., *Lecturer in Law*
Stephen K. Urice, B.A., J.D., Ph.D., *Associate Professor of Law*
Francisco Valdes, B.A., J.D., J.S.M., J.S.D., *Professor of Law*
Markus Wagner, Ph.D., J.S.M., M.J.I., E.J.I., *Associate Professor of Law*
William H. Widen, A.B., J.D., *Professor of Law*
Kele S. Williams, B.S., J.D., *Assistant Professor of Clinical Legal Education, & Associate Director of the Children & Youth Law Clinic*
Richard L. Williamson, Jr., A.B., M.A., J.D., *Professor of Law*
Bruce J. Winick, A.B., J.D., *Professor of Law*
Sally H. Wise, B.A., J.D., M.LL., *Director of the Law Library, & Professor of Law*
Jennifer H. Zawid, B.A., J.D., *Assistant Professor of Clinical Legal Education*

Emeriti

Walter H. Beckham, Jr., A.B., J.D., *Professor Emeritus of Law*
M. Minnette Massey, B.B.A., LL.B., M.A., LL.M., *Professor Emerita of Law*
George Onoprienko, B.B.A., J.D., *Professor Emeritus of Law*
Laurence M. Rose, B.A., J.D., *Professor Emeritus of Law*
Kathryn D. Sowle, B.A., J.D., *Professor Emerita of Law*

Visiting Professors

Helga Audunsdottir, B.S., LL.M., LL.M., *Visiting Associate Professor of Law*
Albert Jan van den Berg, M.A., Ph.D., J.D. *Visiting Professor of Law, Professor at Law and Arbitration Chair*
Miriam Bitton, LL.B., LL.M., LL.M., S.J.D., *Visiting Professor of Law*
Judge Hugo Caminos, J.D., *Senior Lecturer in International Law*
Kenneth Kettering, B.S., J.D., *Visiting Professor of Law*
Fred McChesney, A.B., J.D., Ph.D., *Visiting Professor of Law*
Madeleine Mercedes Plasencia, B.A., J.D., *Visiting Professor of Law*
Kay Seibert, B.A., J.D., *Visiting Lecturer in Law*
Nicolò Trocker, *Visiting Professor of Law*

STATEMENT OF EDITORIAL POLICY

The *University of Miami Law Review* (ISSN 0041-9818) is published quarterly during the fall, winter, spring, and summer by the students of the University of Miami School of Law. Periodicals postage paid at Miami, Florida and additional mailing offices. POSTMASTER: Send address changes to *University of Miami Law Review*, 1311 Miller Drive, University of Miami School of Law, B-349 Law Library, Coral Gables, FL 33124.

SUBSCRIPTIONS: A year's subscription for four issues is \$30.00 for domestic mailing, and \$35.00 for international mailing international, payable in advance. Address your order to *University of Miami Law Review*, 1311 Miller Drive, B-349 Law Library, Coral Gables, FL 33124. If the *University of Miami Law Review* does not receive notice of termination before the expiration of the subscription, it will be automatically renewed. Because the *University of Miami Law Review* holds back issues at its editorial offices for a limited time only, subscribers should report non-receipt of an issue within six months of its mailing or one month following receipt of a succeeding issue.

SINGLE AND BACK ISSUES: Each issue of Volume 65 of the *Review* can be purchased for \$10.00 from the *University of Miami Law Review*. Back issues of Volumes 1–65 are available through William S. Hein and Company, Inc., 1285 Main Street, Buffalo, New York 14209, (800) 828-7571. Back issues can also be found in electronic format on HeinOnline (<http://heinonline.org>).

SUBMISSIONS: The *University of Miami Law Review* invites the submission of unsolicited articles. All submissions should conform to *The Bluebook: A Uniform System of Citation* (19th ed. 2010). In general, the *University of Miami Law Review* follows *The Chicago Manual of Style* (15th ed. 2003) on grammar, style, and usage. Authors seeking publication in the *University of Miami Law Review* should submit manuscripts in Microsoft Word format electronically via its homepage. Please visit us online at <http://umlr.law.miami.edu>.

COPYRIGHT: Copyright (c) 2011 by the *University of Miami Law Review*. The author of each article published in the *Review* grants permission for copies of that article to be made and used for classroom use, provided that the user identifies the author and the journal, affixes proper notice of copyright to each copy, and sends notice and a description of the use to the *University of Miami Law Review*. In addition, the author of each article grants the *University of Miami Law Review* the right to authorize the publication, reproduction, and distribution of the article in electronic, computerized-retrieval systems, and similar forms, and to transfer such rights. For reprint permission for purposes other than classroom use, please contact the *University of Miami Law Review* at the above address, or fax (305) 284-5632. Please allow at least one business week for processing.

University of Miami Law Review

VOLUME 65**SPRING 2011****NUMBER 3**

SPECIAL TOPIC**Gender Justice and Human Rights in the Americas****FOREWORD**

GENDER JUSTICE IN THE AMERICAS: A TRANSNATIONAL DIALOGUE ON SEXUALITY, VIOLENCE, REPRODUCTION, AND HUMAN RIGHTS	<i>Alma Luz Beltrán y Puga et al.</i>	751
---	---------------------------------------	-----

KEYNOTE ADDRESSES

MODERN DAY INQUISITIONS	<i>Rebecca J. Cook</i>	767
WOMEN'S CITIZEN SECURITY	<i>Susana Chiarotti Boero</i>	797

ARTICLES

THE RIGHTS OF WOMEN IN THE INTER-AMERICAN SYSTEM OF HUMAN RIGHTS: CURRENT OPPORTUNITIES AND CHALLENGES IN STANDARD- SETTING	<i>Rosa M. Celorio</i>	819
STILL TREMBLING: STATE OBLIGATION UNDER INTERNATIONAL LAW TO END POST-EARTHQUAKE RAPE IN HAITI	<i>Lisa Davis</i>	867

ESSAYS

ACCESS TO JUSTICE AND THE PERMISSIVE STATE: THE BRAZILIAN EXPERIENCE	<i>Carmen Hein de Campos</i>	893
DOUBLE DISCRIMINATION AND EQUALITY RIGHTS OF INDIGENOUS WOMEN IN QUEBEC	<i>Bernard Duhaime & Josée-Anne Riverin</i>	903

THINKING CRITICALLY ABOUT HOW TO ADDRESS VIOLENCE AGAINST WOMEN	<i>Tamara Rice Lave</i>	923
SEXUAL RIGHTS AND RELIGION: SAME-SEX MARRIAGE AND LAWMAKERS' CATHOLIC IDENTITY IN ARGENTINA	<i>Juan Marco Vaggione</i>	935
MULTIPLE DISCRIMINATION IN ACCESS TO SEXUAL AND REPRODUCTIVE HEALTH: EXPERIENCES FROM LATIN AMERICA AND THE CARIBBEAN	<i>Ximena Casas</i>	955
NEGATIVE IMPACTS OF ABORTION CRIMINALIZATION IN BRAZIL: SYSTEMATIC DENIAL OF WOMEN'S REPRODUCTIVE AUTONOMY AND HUMAN RIGHTS	<i>Beatriz Galli</i>	969
WHO IS A HUMAN RIGHTS DEFENDER? AN ESSAY ON SEXUAL AND REPRODUCTIVE RIGHTS DEFENDERS	<i>Cynthia Soohoo & Diana Hortsch</i>	981

NOTES

LAPTOPS AND THE BORDER SEARCH EXCEPTION TO THE FOURTH AMENDMENT: PROTECTING THE UNITED STATES BORDERS FROM BOMBS, DRUGS, AND THE PICTURES FROM YOUR VACATION	<i>Victoria Wilson</i>	999
A DISTINCTION WITHOUT A DIFFERENCE: "RECEIPT" AND "POSSESSION" OF CHILD PORNOGRAPHY AND THE DOUBLE JEOPARDY PROBLEM	<i>Stephen L. Bacon</i>	1027