

University of Miami Law Review

VOLUME 67

SPRING 2013

NUMBER 3

2012-2013 EXECUTIVE BOARD

RICHARD BRADLEE ROSENGARTEN

Editor in Chief

JEREMY L. KAHN
Executive Editor

STEPHANIE S. SILK
Executive Editor

SOPHIA MONTZ
Senior Articles Editor

JESSICA JOHNSON
*Senior Notes & Comments
Editor*

JOSHUA L. PLAGER
*Senior Notes & Comments
Editor*

ERIKA CONCETTA
PAGANO
Managing Editor

SOPHIA MONTZ
Writing & Research Editor

BRIAN M. STEWART
11th Circuit Editor

NAMRATA JOSHI
Projects Editor

SAMUEL W. WARDLE
Website Editor

LAURA BASSINI
Articles & Comments Editor

ANN MARIE BRODARICK
Articles & Comments Editor

KASHA LEESE
Articles & Comments Editor

OLIVIA KELMAN
Articles & Comments Editor

BRETT NOVICK
Articles & Comments Editor

KAMAL SLEIMAN
Articles & Comments Editor

DAVID G. SWITZER
Articles & Comments Editor

NICHOLAS WILLIAMS
Articles & Comments Editor

EDITORIAL BOARD

CAITLIN BURKE
DANIEL BUTLER
STACY BYRD
ROSS CHAFFIN
MELISSA COATES
SAMANTHA DIMAS
MCKILLOP ERLANDSON
ADAM FISCHER
CHRISTINA FLATAU
LOGAN HAINE-ROBERTS
DANIEL HANLON
NATALIE HARRISON
KELLY HEARD
ALEXANDER HEYDEMANN
CHRISTINA HIMMEL
MATTHEW KOHEN
JONATHAN LAMET

LISA LANHAM
CATHERINE LAUGHLIN
MICHAEL LEVINE
MICHAEL LEWENZ
ZACHARY LUDENS
FREDDI MACK
JOSEPH MAGRISSO
KATIE MASTRUCCI
LINDSEY MAULTASCH
JORDAN MIMOUN
KYLE OHLENSCHLAEGER
RACHEL OOSTENDORP
RACHEL PAUL
GABRIELA PIRANA
LESLIE POLLACK
BRENDAN RYAN
BERNADETTE SADEEK
ERYCA SCHIFFMAN

BRIAN SCHMELKIN
GREGORY SCONZO
JORDAN SHAW
SCOTT SQUIRES
LACEY STUTZ
CUSHLA TALBUT
BENJAMIN TAORMINA
JOSHUA TRUPPMAN
PAULINA VALANTY
BRYAN VEGA
EAMON WELCH
DAVID WERNER
LEAH WESTON
ALYSSA WILLIAMS
JENNA WINCHESTER
KATHRYN YANKOWSKI
JUAN CARLOS ZAMORA

FARAH BARQUERO
Administrative Assistant

UNIVERSITY OF MIAMI SCHOOL OF LAW

ADMINISTRATION

Donna E. Shalala, B.A., Ph.D., *President of the University*
Thomas J. LeBlanc, B.S., M.S., Ph.D., *Provost & Executive Vice President*
Patricia D. White, B.A., M.A., J.D., *Dean & Professor of Law*
Patrick O. Gudridge, A.B., J.D., *Vice Dean & Professor of Law*
Ileana Porras, B.A., M.Phil., J.D., *Associate Dean of Academic Affairs*
Raquel M. Matas, B.A., J.D., *Associate Dean for Administration and Counsel to the Dean*
Douglas K. Bischoff, A.B., J.D., LL.M., *Associate Dean for the Adjunct Faculty & Director of the
Graduate Program in Real Property Development*
Georgina Angones, B.A., *Assistant Dean for Law Development and Alumni Relations*
Marcelyn Cox, B.A., J.D., *Assistant Dean, Career Development Office*
Michael L. Goodnight, B.A., M.S., *Associate Dean of Admissions and Enrollment Management*
Janet E. Stearns, B.A., J.D., *Dean of Students*
Marni B. Lennon, B.A., Ms.Ed., J.D., *Assistant Dean for Public Interest and Pro Bono, Director, HOPE
Public Interest Resource Center*
William P. VanderWyden, III, B.A., M.Ed., J.D., *Assistant Dean for Professional Development*
Ray Grant, B.A., M.S., *Registrar*

FACULTY

David Abraham, B.A., M.A., Ph.D., J.D., *Professor of Law & University of Miami Law Review Faculty
Advisor*
Anthony V. Alfieri, A.B., J.D., *Dean's Distinguished Scholar, Professor of Law & Director of the Center
for Ethics & Public Service*
Terence J. Anderson, B.A., J.D., *Professor of Law*
Paula Arias, J.D., *Director of International Moot Court Program & Lecturer in Law*
Jill Barton, B.J., B.A., M.S., J.D., *Lecturer in Law*
Ricardo Bascuas, B.A., J.D., *Professor of Law*
Ellen Belfer, B.A., J.D., *Lecturer in Law*
Susan E. Bennett, B.S., B.A., M.A., J.D., *Director of James Weldon Johnson Program & Lecturer in Law*
Caroline Bettinger-Lopez, B.A., J.D., *Associate Professor of Clinical Legal Education & Director, Human
Rights Clinic*
William Blatt, A.B., J.D., *Professor of Law*
Caroline M. Bradley, LL.M., *Professor of Law*
Patricia A. Brown, B.S.F.S., J.D., *Director, Graduate Program in Taxation*
Sergio Campos, A.B., J.D., *Associate Professor of Law*
Kenneth M. Casebeer, A.B., J.D., *Professor of Law*
Donna K. Coker, B.S.W., M.S.W., J.D., *Professor of Law*
Mary I. Coombs, B.A., M.A., J.D., *Professor of Law*
Charlton Copeland, B.A., M.A.R., J.D., *Associate Professor of Law*
Caroline Mala Corbin, B.A., J.D., *Associate Professor of Law*
Andrew Dawson, B.A., J.D., *Associate Professor of Law*
Michele DeStefano, B.A., J.D., *Associate Professor of Law*
Stephen M. Diamond, B.A., A.M., Ph.D., J.D., *Professor of Law*
Doud, Mary Teresa, B.A., M.A., J.D., *Lecturer in Law*
Mary Doyle, B.A., LL.B., *Dean Emerita & Professor of Law*
Alyssa Dragnich, B.A., J.D., *Lecturer in Law*
Marc Fajer, A.B., J.D., *Professor of Law*
Zanita E. Fenton, A.B., J.D., *Professor of Law*
Mary Anne Franks, B.A., M.Phil., Ph.D., J.D., *Associate Professor of Law*
Christina M. Frohock, B.A., M.A., J.D., *Lecturer in Law*
A. Michael Froomkin, M.Phil., J.D., *Laurie Silvers and Mitchell Rubenstein Distinguished Professor of Law*
Michael H. Graham, B.S.E., J.D., *Dean's Distinguished Scholar for the Profession, Professor of Law &
Director of Summer Abroad Programs*
Susan Haack, B.A., M.A., B.Phil., Ph.D., *Distinguished Professor in the Humanities, Cooper Senior
Scholar in Arts and Sciences, Professor of Philosophy & Professor of Law*
Stephen K. Halpert, A.B., J.D., *Professor of Law*
Frances R. Hill, B.A., M.A., Ph.D., J.D., LL.M., *Dean's Distinguished Scholar for the Profession,
Professor of Law*
Jennifer Hill, B.A., M.A., J.D., *Lecturer in Law*
Elizabeth M. Iglesias, B.A., J.D., *Professor of Law*
Jan L. Jacobowitz, B.S., J.D., *Director of the Professional Responsibility and Ethics Program & Lecturer
in Law*
Osamudia James, B.A., J.D., LL.M., *Associate Professor of Law*

D. Marvin Jones, B.S., J.D., *Professor of Law*
Stanley I. Langbein, A.B., J.D., *Professor of Law*
Tamara Rice Lave, B.A., M.A., Ph.D., J.D., *Associate Professor of Law*
Lili Levi, A.B., J.D., *Professor of Law*
Dennis O. Lynch, B.A., J.D., J.S.D., LL.M., *Dean Emeritus & Professor of Law*
Martha R. Mahoney, B.A., M.A., J.D., *Professor of Law*
Elliott Manning, A.B., J.D., *Dean's Distinguished Scholar for the Profession, Professor of Law*
Fred McChesney, A.B., J.D., Ph.D., *Carlos de la Cruz-Soia Mentschikoff Chair in Law and Economics & Lecturer in Law*
Felix Mormann, J.D., LL.M., *Associate Professor of Law*
Jessica Carvalho Morris, J.D., *Director of International Graduate Law Programs*
Sarah A. Mourer, B.S., J.D., *Director of the Capital Defense Project and Miami Innocence Project & Associate Professor of Clinical Legal Education*
George Mundstock, B.A., J.D., *Professor of Law*
Peter Nemerovski, B.A., J.D., *Lecturer in Law*
JoNel Newman, B.A., J.D., *Director of the Health and Elder Law Clinic & Professor of Clinical Legal Education*
James W. Nickel, B.A., Ph.D., *Professor of Philosophy & Professor of Law*
Leigh Osofsky, A.B., J.D., *Associate Professor of Law*
Bernard H. Oxman, A.B., J.D., *Richard A. Hausler Endowed Chair & Professor of Law*
Kunal Parker, A.B., M.A., J.D., Ph.D., *Dean's Distinguished Scholar & Professor of Law*
Jan Paulsson, A.B., J.D., *Michael Klein Distinguished Scholar Chair & Professor of Law*
Bernard P. Perlmutter, B.A., J.D., *Director of the Children & Youth Law Clinic & Professor of Clinical Legal Education*
Shara Pelz, B.A., J.D., *Lecturer in Law*
Alejandro Portes, B.A., M.A., Ph.D., *Professor of Sociology & Professor of Law*
Tina Portuondo, B.A., J.D., LL.M., *Director of the Heckerling Institute on Estate Planning*
Thomas A. Robinson, B.S., J.D., B.Litt., *Professor of Law*
Scott Rogers, B.S., M.S., J.D., *Director, Mindfulness and the Law Program & Lecturer in Law*
Laurence M. Rose, B.A., J.D., *Director of the Litigation Skills Program & Professor of Law Emeritus*
Robert E. Rosen, A.B., M.A., J.D., Ph.D., *Professor of Law*
Keith S. Rosenn, B.A., LL.B., *Professor of Law & Chair of Foreign Graduate Law Program*
Edgardo Rotman, J.D., LL.M., Ph.D., LL.B., *Foreign & International Law Librarian Emeritus & Senior Lecturer in International & Comparative Law*
Andres Sawicki, S.B., J.D., *Associate Professor of Law*
Stephen J. Schnably, A.B., J.D., *Professor of Law*
Rebecca Sharpless, B.A., M.Phil., J.D., *Associate Professor of Clinical Legal Education*
Rachel Smith, B.A., J.D., *Lecturer in Law*
Rachel Stabler, B.A., J.D., *Lecturer in Law*
Kele Stewart, B.S., J.D., *Professor of Clinical Legal Education*
Irwin P. Stotzky, B.A., J.D., *Professor of Law*
Scott Sundby, B.A., J.D., *Dean's Distinguished Scholar & Professor of Law*
Jessi Tamayo, B.A., J.D., *Director of Public Programming & Lecturer in Law*
Karen Throckmorton, B.A., J.D., LL.M., *Director Street Law Program & Lecturer in Law*
Annette Torres, B.A., M.B.A., J.D., *Lecturer in Law*
Stephen K. Urice, B.A., Ph.D., J.D., *Professor of Law*
Francisco Valdes, B.A., J.D., J.S.M., J.S.D., *Dean's Distinguished Scholar & Professor of Law*
Teresa Verges, B.A. J.D., *Director, Investor Rights Clinic & Lecturer in Law*
Markus Wagner, J.S.M., M.J.I., J.D., *Associate Professor of Law*
William H. Widen, A.B., J.D., *Professor of Law*
Richard L. Williamson, Jr., A.B., M.A., J.D., *Professor of Law*
Sally H. Wise, B.A., J.D., M.LL., *Director of the Law Library & Professor of Law*
Jennifer H. Zawid, B.A., J.D., *Director of the Externship Program & Lecturer in Law*
Cheryl Zuckerman, B.A., J.D., *Lecturer in Law*

Emeriti

M. Minnette Massey, B.B.A., LL.B., M.A., LL.M., *Professor Emerita of Law*
Kathryn D. Sowle, B.A., J.D., *Professor Emerita of Law*

Visiting Professors

Albert Jan van den Berg, M.A., Ph.D., J.D. *Visiting Professor of Law*
David Fagundes, A.B., J.D., *Visiting Professor of Law*
Stefanie Kuerpick, J.D., *Visiting Assistant Professor*

STATEMENT OF EDITORIAL POLICY

The *University of Miami Law Review* (ISSN 0041-9818) is published quarterly during the fall, winter, spring, and summer by the students of the University of Miami School of Law. Periodicals postage paid at Miami, Florida and additional mailing offices. POSTMASTER: Send address changes to *University of Miami Law Review*, 1311 Miller Drive, University of Miami School of Law, B-349 Law Library, Coral Gables, FL 33124.

SUBSCRIPTIONS: One year's subscription for four issues/one volume is \$40.00 for domestic mailing and \$50.00 for international mailing, payable in advance. Single Issues are \$15.00. Address your order to *University of Miami Law Review*, 1311 Miller Drive, B-349 Law Library, Coral Gables, FL 33124. If the *University of Miami Law Review* does not receive notice of termination before the expiration of the subscription, it will be automatically renewed. Because the *University of Miami Law Review* holds back issues at its editorial offices for a limited time only, subscribers should report non-receipt of an issue within six months of its mailing or one month following receipt of a succeeding issue.

SINGLE AND BACK ISSUES: Each issue of Volume 67 of the *Review* can be purchased for \$15.00 from the *University of Miami Law Review*. Back issues of Volumes 1–66 are available through William S. Hein and Company, Inc., 1285 Main Street, Buffalo, New York 14209, (800) 828-7571. Back issues can also be found in electronic format on HeinOnline (<http://heinonline.org>).

SUBMISSIONS: The *University of Miami Law Review* invites the submission of unsolicited articles. All submissions should conform to *The Bluebook: A Uniform System of Citation* (19th ed. 2010). In general, the *University of Miami Law Review* follows *The Redbook: A Manual on Legal Style* (2d ed. 2006) on grammar, style, and usage. Authors seeking publication in the *University of Miami Law Review* should submit manuscripts in Microsoft Word format electronically through its homepage. Please visit us online at <http://lawreview.law.miami.edu/>.

COPYRIGHT: Copyright © 2013 by the *University of Miami Law Review*. The author of each article published in the *Review* grants permission for copies of that article to be made and used for classroom use, provided that the user identifies the author and the journal, affixes proper notice of copyright to each copy, and sends notice and a description of the use to the *University of Miami Law Review*. In addition, the author of each article grants the *University of Miami Law Review* the right to authorize the publication, reproduction, and distribution of the article in electronic, computerized-retrieval systems, and similar forms, and to transfer such rights. For reprint permission for purposes other than classroom use, please contact the *University of Miami Law Review* at the above address, or fax (305) 284-5632. Please allow at least one business week for processing.

University of Miami Law Review

VOLUME 67**SPRING 2013****NUMBER 3**

ARTICLES

- MOVING TOWARD LAW: REFOCUSING THE
FEDERAL COURTS' PLAIN ERROR DOCTRINE
IN CRIMINAL CASES *Dustin D. Berger* 521
- MANDATING PRECONTRACTUAL DISCLOSURE *Eric H. Franklin* 553
- A LEGAL ANALYSIS OF ROMANTIC GIFTS *Ruth Sarah Lee* 595

NOTES & COMMENTS

- MORE DECENTRALIZATION, LESS LIABILITY:
THE FUTURE OF SYSTEMIC DISPARATE
TREATMENT CLAIMS IN THE WAKE OF
WAL-MART v. DUKES *Stephanie S. Silk* 637
- APPLICATION OF THE COPYRIGHT TERMINATION
PROVISION TO THE MUSIC INDUSTRY: SOUND
RECORDINGS SHOULD CONSTITUTE WORKS
MADE FOR HIRE *Jessica Johnson* 661
- ALL THINGS EQUAL: UNINTENDED
CONSEQUENCES AND ALLEGEDLY
MISREPRESENTED STATISTICS *Joshua L. Plager* 681
- INTERPRETING LIABILITY UNDER THE ALIEN
TORT STATUTE *Rachel Paul* 705
- THEY'RE NOT YOURS, THEY ARE MY OWN:
HOW NCAA EMPLOYMENT RESTRICTIONS
VIOLATE ANTITRUST LAW *Gregory Sconzo* 737

UNIVERSITY OF MIAMI LAW REVIEW